

MINUTES OF THE MONTCLAIR HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
February 19, 2009

PRESENT: Ira Smith, Denis Orloff, Jonathan Perlstein, Andrew Hageman, Frank Rubacky, Diane Scotland, Christie Rule and Commission Secretary Patrick Franco Jr.

ABSENT: NONE

ORDER AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 pm by Commissioner Smith. Mr. Franco read the notice of compliance with the New Jersey Open Public Meetings Act and indicated that appropriate notice was forwarded to the officially designated newspaper of Montclair and also posted in the Municipal Building. The schedule of meetings is also posted on Montclair Township's web site.

OLD BUSINESS

- 1. Mitch MacGregor**
HPC 2007-11
91 Pine Street

Chairman Smith called for the representatives of this application to come forward. Mitch MacGregor, property owner, came forward and was sworn.

Chairman Smith gave a brief background of the application history. In 2007, the Department of Code Enforcement reported the original porch was demolished and a new porch was constructed without HPC approval which was subsequently denied because of an inappropriate architectural design. Over the last two years the applicant has returned to the Commission a number of times with insufficient detail on the proposed handrail, the fascia, columns, guardrail, and lattice. In November 2008 the applicant submitted plans for review by a sub-committee and received feedback in December 2008. The sub-committee had the following comments:

1. Guardrail: Notes indicate a 4" space between balusters, which does not meet current building code (space must be less than 4"). Also, drawings don't show how a handrail will be provided on the stair portion of the guardrail. This is required by current building code and, if handled poorly, will have an adverse impact on appearance of the guardrail.
2. Newel Posts: As drawn, they are in the wrong location. They should be sitting further up the stair run. See period photograph. Also, the newel posts as drawn are underscaled. They should have a larger footprint.

3. Fascia: As drawn, it does not have enough detail. There is an obvious shadowline in the period photograph. An additional trim piece must be shown on the fascia.

Commissioner Perlstein stated that the coordination between the details and the elevations were not the same.

Chairman Smith stated that the coordination between the details and the floor plan are also inaccurate.

Vice Chairman Orloff asked if the roof is pitched or flat. Mr. MacGregor stated it will be pitched like the photo. Vice Chairman Orloff stated that the lattice should be vertical and horizontal; not diagonal.

Chairman Smith stated that a handrail will be required by code and none is depicted on the plans.

Chairman Smith, upon hearing no further questions and discussion from the Commissioners, opened the meeting up to the public. No public comments were offered on this application and the meeting was closed to the public.

On a motion by Commissioner Orloff, and seconded by Commissioner Scotland the Commission voted to approve the application with conditions in a vote of 5 ayes, 2 nays, and no abstentions.

The following are conditions of approval:

1. New plans should be submitted with accurate dimensions and coordination between the elevations, floor plan, and details
2. The geometry of the deck should match the original base below
3. The lattice should be vertical and horizontal
4. The wood fascia should be $\frac{3}{4}$ " below the eave
5. A detail on the handrail and its termination should be submitted
6. A sub-committee shall be formed with the applicants architect

2. Amy Chen

HPC 2009-1

44 Upper Montclair Plaza

Chairman Smith called for the representatives of this application to come forward. Andy Sun, applicant and Warren Ross, property owner, came forward and were sworn.

The applicant is returning to the Commission after appearing at the January 15, 2008 meeting. At that that time the Commission asked for more installation details.

A new wood sign measuring 18" high by 14" wide and ¾" deep is proposed with hand painted lettering. The sign will be attached to a right angle aluminum and metal triangle which will be affixed to the roof with lag screws.

Commissioner Rubacky stated that the installation details do not match the elevation.

Chairman Smith followed up by stating that the Building Department has jurisdiction over installation as per the building code.

Chairman Smith, upon hearing no further questions and discussion from the Commissioners, opened the meeting up to the public.

Dick Grabowski, 470 Bloomfield Avenue, stated that the L-bracket should be no more than 1 ¾" as per the depth of the sign.

On a motion by Commissioner Scotland, and seconded by Commissioner Perlstein the Commission voted to approve the application as submitted in a vote of 7 ayes, no nays, and no abstentions.

3. 239-245 Lorraine Ave LLC

HPC 2008-49

239-245 Lorraine Ave

Chairman Smith called for the representatives of this application to come forward. Mike Pavel, Property Owner, and Paul Sionas and Mike Sweebe, Sionas Architecture, came forward and were sworn.

The applicant appeared at the October 16, 2008 meeting for a *Conceptual Review* and at the January 15, 2009 meeting with a full application. At the last meeting the Commission again expressed their overall satisfaction with the design but asked that the Lorraine Avenue (western façade) be redesigned with a pedestrian scale in mind.

The proposal calls for the demolition of the two existing buildings and the construction of a 3-story mixed use building and parking deck. The proposal calls for 11,000 square feet of retail space, 10,000 square foot gym, 35 residential units and 141 space parking deck.

Mr. Sionas stated that the team met with a sub-committee of Chairman Smith, Vice Chairman Orloff, and Secretary Franco on January 15th and made the following revisions:

- The center arch is lower and sweeping
- The center column has been replaced with two brick piers
- Portico under the main arch
- Parking deck entry was reduced to 14 feet
- Signage will be hung by cables from arch
- Sun shades for 2nd and 3rd floor windows

Secretary Franco asked if any changes have been made to the other three facades. Mr. Sionas stated that changes were made to reflect the changes on the Lorraine Ave façade.

Commissioner Perlstein asked if the clock is a window. Mr. Sionas stated that it is.

Commissioner Rule asked what the signage material is. Mr. Sionas stated 12 inch metal letters.

Chairman Smith stated that a lighting spec should be submitted.

Chairman Smith, upon hearing no further questions and discussion from the Commissioners, opened the meeting up to the public.

John Reimnitz, architect, stated that the design would be a great benefit to the Upper Montclair Historic District.

On a motion by Commissioner Orloff, and seconded by Commissioner Scotland the Commission voted to approve the application with conditions in a vote of 7 ayes, no nays, and no abstentions.

The following are conditions of approval:

1. The clock is a window
2. The signage and lighting plan is conceptual
3. Submit details on 3rd floor aluminum panels and add scoring detail

NEW BUSINESS

4. 622-624 Valley Rd LLC HPC 2009-4 622-624 Valley Rd

Chairman Smith called for the representatives of this application to come forward. Mike Pavel, Property Owner, and Paul Sionas and Mike Sweebe, Sionas Architecture, came forward and were sworn.

At the October 16, 2008, the Commission granted approval for both the Valley Road and rear façade redesign.

The applicant is returning to the Commission for a proposed 3rd floor to accommodate 5 dwelling units. In addition, the applicant is also seeking approval for two new doors (1 on Valley Road and 1 in the rear).

Mr. Pavel stated that the elevator shaft was already built to accommodate a third floor prior to Commission approval. Mr. Pavel stated that he will do whatever the Commission requires.

Mr. Sionas stated that the 3rd floor addition brings the height to 39 feet 6 inches on Valley Road which is 5 feet higher than the neighbor to the south. The third floor windows are setback 6 feet from the line of the 2nd floor windows. The side walls of the addition will be stucco.

Commissioner Rubacky asked where does the stucco end and the brick start. Mr. Sionas stated that the entire side is stucco except for the brick return at the rear. Commissioner Rubacky asked if there was timbering or detail on the sides. Mr. Sionas stated no.

Commissioner Scotland stated that more detail and better articulation should be given to the sides of the building. Vice Chairman Orloff agreed.

Commissioner Rule asked that the 3rd floor dormers be scaled down and the windows be detailed like the 2nd floor.

Chairman Smith suggested lowering the ridges on the upper most gables and string course at the rear façade should be removed.

Commissioner Rubacky asked if the landscape plan will remain the same. Mr. Sionas stated yes.

Chairman Smith, upon hearing no further questions and discussion from the Commissioners, opened the meeting up to the public. No public comments were offered on this application and the meeting was closed to the public.

On a motion by Vice Chairman Orloff, and seconded by Commissioner Perlstein the Commission voted to approve the application with conditions in a vote of 7 ayes, no nays, and no abstentions.

The following are conditions of approval:

1. The proposed doors should be recessed to the plane of the storefronts
2. The peak of the roof should be raised to form a parapet
3. The 3rd floor dormers shall be scaled down
4. 3rd floor window detail should be added
5. The stringcourse on the rear façade shall be eliminated
6. The depth of the sunshade on the rear façade shall be increased
7. A sub-committee shall review the amended plans

5. David Genova

HPC 2009-5

339-345 Bloomfield Ave

Chairman Smith called for the representatives of this application to come forward. John Reimnitz, architect, David Genova, and John Ferguson were sworn.

The proposal calls for the following renovation of the building façade at **345 Bloomfield Ave** (western most building):

- Resurface and repaint existing stucco
- New wood trim on 2nd floor windows to match existing
- Aluminum sunshade system to cover door leading to 2nd floor
- New spandrel glass with lettering for signage
- New copper awning over storefront system
- New storefront system and bluestone base

The proposal calls for the following renovation of the building façade at **339-343 Bloomfield Ave** (eastern most building):

- New coping stone, brick face, steel column, lintel
- New aluminum sunshade system
- New spandrel glass with lettering for signage
- New storefront system and bluestone base

Mr. Reimnitz stated that a brick veneer face would be used with an exposed steel spandrel. New wood trim windows will be introduced in the same openings.

Commissioner Perlstein asked why an oversized brick was selected. Mr. Reimnitz stated that it's a modern building and will include solar shades.

Commissioner Rule asked what the awning material was. Mr. Reimnitz stated it is a standing seam copper roof. Chairman Smith asked if the sides would be open. Mr. Reimnitz stated yes.

Commissioner Rule recommended that the awning be slightly lowered below the window above.

Commissioner Rule asked the color of the stucco. Mr. Reimnitz stated a yellowish hue.

Chairman Smith asked if the existing stucco will be removed to the base. Mr. Reimnitz said no.

Mr. Genova presented the board with what is typically called "garden state brick face" and whether it would be an acceptable material in the downtown. The Commission stated that the material presented would never be acceptable in the historic district.

Chairman Smith, upon hearing no further questions and discussion from the Commissioners, opened the meeting up to the public. No public comments were offered on this application and the meeting was closed to the public.

On a motion by Commissioner Rule, and seconded by Commissioner Hageman the Commission voted to approve the application with conditions in a vote of 7 ayes, no nays, and no abstentions.

The following are conditions of approval:

1. Thin set non-terra cotta brick veneer, similar to Garden State Brick Face, would not be acceptable in any Historic District or on Historic Landmarks
2. A cut sheet on the proposed windows must be submitted
3. The copper awning should be slightly lowered below the window above
4. Photographic inventory of façade as alterations occur

Commissioner Scotland left the meeting.

6. William Dubiel

HPC 2009-6

310 Bloomfield Ave

Chairman Smith called for the representatives of this application to come forward. William Dubiel came forward and was sworn.

The proposal calls for (2) new aluminum signs with printed vinyl lettering and design over each storefront entrance measuring 120" by 24". The proposal also calls for (4) new Sumbrella canvas awnings.

The applicant was notified that the proposed Star design was outside the sign band and decided to withdraw them from the application.

Mr. Smith asked if the Commission would consider making the star on the proposed sign dimensional. The Commission agreed.

Vice Chairman Orloff asked how far the star would be set off the sign. Mr. Dubiel stated $\frac{3}{4}$ ".

Chairman Smith, upon hearing no further questions and discussion from the Commissioners, opened the meeting up to the public. No public comments were offered on this application and the meeting was closed to the public.

On a motion by Vice Chairman Orloff, and seconded by Commissioner Rule the Commission voted to approve the application with conditions in a vote of 6 ayes, no nays, and no abstentions.

The following are conditions of approval:

1. A three-dimensional star is permitted on the sign
2. The proposed stars on the façade are omitted
3. The awning color shall match the sign

PUBLIC COMMENT

Dick Grabowski, 470 Bloomfield Ave, stated that the Commission is functioning well but should raise their application standards.

APPROVAL OF RESOLUTIONS

Commissioner Rubacky moved to memorialize the resolutions as amended and seconded by Commissioner Rule in a vote of 6 ayes, no nays, and no abstentions.

- | | |
|----------------|-----------------------|
| 1. HPC 2008-46 | 5 North Fullerton Ave |
| 2. HPC 2008-57 | 379 Bloomfield Ave |
| 3. HPC 2008-58 | 229 Glenridge Ave |
| 4. HPC 2009-2 | 242 Bellevue Ave |
| 5. HPC 2009-3 | 470 Bloomfield Ave |

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Commissioner Rubacky moved to memorialize the minutes of February 19, 2009 as submitted and seconded by Commissioner Rule in a vote of 6 ayes, no nays, and no abstentions.

Adjourn

At 11:30 pm, Commissioner Rubacky moved to adjourn the meeting. This was seconded by Commissioner Rule.

Respectfully submitted,
Patrick J. Franco Jr., recording secretary